

(Translated Version)

**Lantau Development Advisory Committee
Sustainable Development Subcommittee and
Traffic, Transport and District Improvement Items Subcommittee**

Second Joint Meeting

Date: 2 May 2017 (Tuesday)

Time: 2:00 pm to 5:15 pm

Venue: Conference Room 6, G/F, Central Government Offices, 2 Tim Mei Avenue,
Tamar, Hong Kong

Gist of Meeting

Members in Attendance

Dr LAM Kin-ngok, Peter	Chairperson of the Sustainable Development Subcommittee
Mr LAU Ping-cheung	Chairperson of the Traffic, Transport and District Improvement Items Subcommittee
Mr LAM Siu-lo, Andrew	Deputy Chairperson of the Sustainable Development Subcommittee
Ms CHAU Chuen-heung	Deputy Chairperson of the Traffic, Transport and District Improvement Items Subcommittee
Dr FANG Zhou, Joe	
Professor HO Kin-chung	
Mr KWOK Ching-kwong, Francis	
Mr LAM Fan-keung, Franklin	
Dr LAU Wai-neng, Michael	
Hon WU Chi-wai	
Mr MAK Shing-cheung, Vincent	Deputy Secretary for Development (Works)2, Development Bureau (DEVB)
Mr LAI Cheuk-ho	Principal Assistant Secretary (Works)5, DEVB
Ms TANG Tsui-ye, Caroline	Assistant Secretary (Planning & Lands)1, DEVB
Mr TSANG Wing-keung, Rico	Assistant Secretary for Transport and Housing (Transport)3B, Transport and Housing Bureau (THB)

(Translated Version)

Ms KIANG Kam-yin, Ginger	Project Manager (Hong Kong Island & Islands) (Atg.), Civil Engineering and Development Department (CEDD)	
Ms LI Chi-miu, Phyllis	Deputy Director of Planning/Territorial, Planning Department (PlanD)	
Ms HO Wai-yin, Irene	Assistant Commissioner/New Territories, Transport Department (TD)	
Mr TANG Kin-fai	Assistant Director (Environment Assessment), Environmental Protection Department (EPD)	
Mr LAI Chuen-chi, Patrick	Assistant Director (Country & Marine Parks), Agriculture, Fisheries and Conservation Department (AFCD)	
Mr NG Che-on, Raymond	Assistant Director-General of Civil Aviation (Airport Standards)(Atg.), Civil Aviation Department	
Miss CHONG Yan-ye, Belinda	Assistant District Officer (Islands)1	
Mr WONG Kwok-fai	Senior Engineer/Technical Services	
Ms CHUNG Yuk-fong, Shirley	Chief Executive Officer (Planning)2, Leisure and Cultural Services Department	
Ms CHOI Tin-yan, Cally	Manager (Tourism)22, Commerce and Economic Development Bureau (CEDB)	
Mr WONG Chi-leung	Senior Engineer 13 (Islands), CEDD	Secretary

Co-opted Members

Mr CHAN Kit, William
Mr CHEUNG Tsz-kei
Ms CHIU Sin-ting
Ms LAU Shuk-han, Rita
Dr LEE Shu-wing, Ernest
Mr LUK Hon-man, Benson
Mr TSANG Wai-him, William
Mr WONG Man-hon

Absent with Apologies:

Hon CHAN Han-pan
Mr HA Wing-on, Allen
Hon MAK Mei-kuen, Alice

(Translated Version)

Dr WANG Jixian, James
Mr YAU Ying-wah, Algernon
Hon YIU Si-wing
Mr YU Hon-kwan, Randy
Mr KWOK Ping, Eric
Mr LO Kwong-shing, Andy
Mr WONG Fuk-kan

(Note: Members' written submissions on traffic and conservation issues were submitted via the Secretariat for consideration (see Annex 1).)

In Attendance

Mr Leo WONG	Executive Assistant to CEO, Asia World-Expo
Ms YAU Man-shan, Doris	Assistant Secretary (Land Supply) 1, DEVB
Mr WONG Yin-kai, Vincent	Assistant Secretary (Land Supply) 3, DEVB
Miss WONG Pui-yue, Erica	Senior Executive Officer (Lantau), DEVB
Mr SIU Kang-chuen	Chief Traffic Engineer/New Territories East, TD
Mr LING Kar-kan	Conservation Coordinator, CEDD
Ms LAU Yiu-yan, Joyce	Chief Engineer/Special Projects, CEDD
Mr MA Hon-wing, Wilson	Senior Engineer/Project Management (Islands), CEDD
Mr SZETO Hon-yin	Senior Engineer 9 (Islands), CEDD
Mr CHAN Tang-lun, Leo	Senior Engineer 18 (Special Duties), CEDD
Ms SO Shuk-ye, Joan	Senior Town Planner 2(Special Duties), CEDD
Mr YIP Yuk-tsang, Steven	Engineer 17 (Special Duties), CEDD
Mr CHAN Wing-tak	Town Planner 1(Special Duties), CEDD
Ms TO Wai-tsz, Isabella	Senior Manager (Hong Kong Island and Islands), CEDD
Mr CHAN Sze-wai, Kevin	Senior Town Planner/Strategic Planning 6, PlanD

The Chairperson of the Sustainable Development Subcommittee (hereafter referred to as "SD SC") welcomed Members, Co-opted Members and representatives of government departments to attend the second joint meeting of the SD SC and Traffic,

(Translated Version)

Transport and District Improvement Items Subcommittee (hereafter referred to as “TTDII SC”).

Agenda Item 1: Green Traffic and Transport Strategy Jointly Submitted By Green Groups

(Attachment – a letter jointly submitted by Green Groups to the Secretary for Development on 31 August 2016)

1. The Chairperson of SD SC pointed out that the proposed green traffic and transport strategies for Lantau were jointly submitted by green groups to the Secretary of Development on 31 August 2016. He invited the green groups¹ in attendance to brief Members on such proposals.

2. The green group representatives briefed Members on the proposed green traffic and transport strategies, suggesting that the Government should take into account the living quality of Lantau residents, tourism resources, road safety, drinking water collection and ecology environment in devising the design of strategic traffic and transport infrastructures. Their proposals/views were consolidated as follows:
 - (i) The Government should pay serious attention to the adverse environmental impacts on Lantau caused by traffic and transport. For instance, Tung Chung on Northern Lantau was ranked as one of the three most heavily polluted areas in Hong Kong between 2014 and 2016;
 - (ii) On the front of environmental protection and conservation of ecology, law enforcement was neither easy nor effective at present;
 - (iii) Given the environmental impacts caused by the opening up of the roads in the Sha Tau Kok Closed Area, it was proposed that the Government should not relax the traffic restriction in South Lantau. In addition, the Government should restrict coaches and private vehicles from entering Tung Chung Road and South Island Road, and scrap the issue of closed road permits for the “Driving on Lantau Island” Scheme to avoid environmental destruction;
 - (iv) The Government should stringently restrict heavy vehicles, in particular dump trucks, heavy goods vehicles and works vehicles, from entering South Lantau and Tung Chung Road to the west of Ma Wan Sun Tsuen. The use

¹ The green groups in attendance included Green Power, Designing Hong Kong, The Conservancy Association, Hong Kong Bird Watching Society, Living Island Movement, The Green Earth, World Wide Fund for Nature (HK), Association for Geoconservation, Hong Kong and Kadoorie Farm & Botanic Garden.

(Translated Version)

of appropriate technology, for instance global positioning systems, may also be considered to monitor and track the vehicles delivering construction and solid wastes;

- (v) The Government should protect the wide catchment areas in remote areas, with a view to safeguarding the drinking water quality;
- (vi) Priority should be given to adopting the green public transport modes, and enhancing service frequencies of ferries and cross-district buses during public holidays;
- (vii) The relevant government departments should step up enforcement efforts, such as monitoring the number of vehicles entering the closed roads in Lantau, sending sufficient law enforcement officers, patrolling the closed roads on a daily and regular basis, installing closed circuit televisions and automatic speed detection devices, as well as setting up gates to be stationed by officers;
- (viii) Construction of new roads in Lantau should be well justified and subject to its cost effectiveness and impact on the environment. In addition, the Government should refrain from constructing new roads in locations of ecological significance, and consult the public as appropriate; and
- (ix) Well phased improvement works to the existing roads would be supported.

3. Members enquired in response to the proposals/views expressed by the green groups. The responses from the green groups were consolidated as follows:

- (i) There were at present no specific indicator and data standards for assessing the environmental carrying capacity of Lantau, including the environmental impacts caused by the flow of people, goods and vehicles. That said, they hoped that the Government could make good use of technology to monitor the environmental destruction activities in Lantau, take into account the health and living quality of residents, as well as devise the indicators in the contexts of air and water quality, noise level and traffic flow, which would serve as the data standards for assessing the environmental carrying capacity of Lantau;
- (ii) In addition to restricting the wastes generated outside Lantau, the Government should also manage the wastes generated from Lantau. Consideration should be given to strengthening the regulation of the wastes and inert construction materials generated from the Tung Chung New Town Extension project and local developments in South Lantau, in a bid to avoid spoiling the natural landscapes and environments in Lantau; and
- (iii) Despite the fact that there were at present no studies conducted on the source

(Translated Version)

of air particulates in Tung Chung, they believed that traffic was one of the major factors contributing to such a problem.

4. The Chairperson of SD SC expressed gratitude to the green group representatives for attending the meeting, and indicated that the SD SC would seriously consider their views.

(The green group representatives left the meeting)

5. In response to the views from the green group representatives, some Members enquired as to whether the Government could provide relevant indicators or figures, such as the maximum vehicle flow on roads, which would serve as objective standards for assessment.
6. Mr TANG Kin-fai, Assistant Director (Environment Assessment), EPD, pointed out that the air quality condition was subject to the influence of both regional and local factors. The regional factors were determined by the situation in the Pearl River Delta, while the local factors included the road traffic impacts, which were subject to separations between roads and residents, as well as vehicular flows and types. To keep the air pollution level within the established indicator range, environmental assessments need to be conducted to evaluate all the factors, including the design vehicular flows and traffic routes of roads, etc.
7. Some Members enquired as to whether it was feasible to adopt a zero-emission policy for Lantau. Ms HO Wai-yin, Irene, Assistant Commissioner/New Territories, TD, pointed out that the number of vehicles entering South Lantau was at present under restriction, while closed road permits would only be issued to local residents and vehicles when deemed necessary. The Government needed to take into account the residents' needs and actual circumstances in considering the proposed introduction of zero-emission policy. It was believed that difficulties would be encountered in policy execution. In case the zero-emission policy was introduced, the Government would need to carry out district-level consultations in a comprehensive manner.
8. Some Members proposed that the Government could make good use of technology to reduce pollution, such as the tracking of dump trucks in a bid to strengthen the regulation of flytipping; full introduction of the Euro V standard or more advanced models for coaches; as well as promotion of electric vehicles. Another member considered that the Government should devise its carbon emission reduction target

(Translated Version)

in the light of the overall development direction of Hong Kong. In addition, he proposed that the Government could devise implementation programme to implement carbon emission reduction initiatives for vehicles in phases, under which use of green vehicles would be implemented for public transport modes in the first stage, while members of the public would be encouraged to switch to more environmentally-friendly vehicles in the second stage.

9. Some Members pointed out that it was a great pity that some lands were left idle for a long time because of restrictions on development purposes. Some other Members considered that focus should not be placed on trivial matters, and the Government should instead step up the overall planning and conservation efforts to fully utilise the land.

Agenda Item 2: Confirmation of the Gist of the Last Meeting

10. As Members raised no objection, the gist of last meeting was endorsed.

Agenda Item 3: Matters Arising

11. The Secretary reported that the CEDD proposed the setting up of a Task Force on Lantau Conservation (the Task Force) under the SD SC at the last meeting. The Government and relevant stakeholders including green groups and locals could then join hands in examining and exploring conservation projects to be implemented in Lantau through the Task Force and put forward proposals to the SD SC. The work progress of the Task Force was detailed in agenda item 5.

Agenda Item 4: Progress of Strategic Studies and Local Improvement Works Items in Lantau (SD SC & TTDII SC Paper No. 01/2017)

12. The Secretariat briefed Members on this document.
13. Some Members enquired about the transport arrangements upon the commissioning of the Hong Kong Boundary Crossing Facilities of Hong Kong-Zhuhai-Macao Bridge (“HZMB”), including the parking space arrangements for vehicles to and from the three places, arrangements for feeder buses and minibuses, as well as toll levels for HZMB users, etc. Some other Members enquired, in addition to long-term options, whether the arrangements for temporary parking spaces would also be covered in such studies.

(Translated Version)

14. Regarding the temporary transport arrangements upon the commissioning of HZMB, Mr MAK Shing-cheung, Vincent, Deputy Secretary for Development (Works)², DEVB, responded that the Government would report to the Members when the options were finalized. Mr TSANG Wing-keung, Rico, Assistant Secretary for Transport and Housing (Transport)^{3B}, THB, pointed out that the Governments of the three places were still in discussion of the transport arrangements in relation to HZMB.
15. As the Tung Chung East reclamation works were anticipated to be completed at end 2023, some Members enquired whether it referred to the completion time for such reclamation works or the first population intake time. The Members considered that existing community facilities at Tung Chung West were insufficient and therefore there was an urgent need to launch new projects to dovetail with the new developments in the area. Ms TANG Tsui-ye, Caroline, Assistant Secretary (Planning & Lands)¹, DEVB, responded that the Government expected the first population intake would take place in 2023. The detailed designs of Tung Chung West Developments commenced in the third quarter of 2016 and the funding application for the works would be submitted to the Legislative Council upon finalisation of the details of the option.

Agenda Item 5: Progress Report of “Task Force on Lantau Conservation”

(SD SC Paper No. 02/2017)

16. Ms SO Shuk-ye, Joan, Senior Town Planner 2 (Special Duties), CEDD, briefed Members on this document.
17. Some members proposed examining the setting up of a conservation fund for Lantau as a pilot scheme, as well as application of the Lands Resumption Ordinance on the front of conserving sites with high ecological value, with a view to resolving the problems of private property right and conflicts between urban and rural, etc. Some other Members also considered that the Government should allocate additional resources to take forward conservation projects as appropriate, such as the setting up of databases. In addition to vetting funding applications made to such a fund for specific conservation projects, the Government could also draw reference to the overseas practice, under which such a fund might be run in the form of trust funds.
18. In addition to the Environment and Conservation Fund under the Environment Bureau (ENB), Members proposed exploring the use of the Innovation and

(Translated Version)

Technology Fund under the Innovation and Technology Bureau. Joining hands with the Science Park, technology enterprises and universities etc., the Government could explore the application of new technology to promote the conservation projects for Lantau.

19. Some Members opined that strategic environmental assessments should be conducted to enhance their understanding of the environment impacts caused by Lantau developments, which in their views could resolve the issues relating to Lantau in a more effective manner, as compared to the current fragmented discussions.

20. Mr MAK Shing-cheung, Vincent, Deputy Secretary for Development (Works)², DEVB, responded in his consolidated reply that the DEVB was collaborating with the ENB to discuss matters relating to the Conservation Fund. On another front, the Environment and Conservation Fund had reserved \$30 million to implement the conservation projects for South Lantau in 2017-18, and the Government hoped to discuss with green groups to collaborate on expediting short-term conservation projects for Pui O, Shui Hau etc., as well as to subsequently study controversial items and items requiring relatively long study period.

21. Some Members pointed out that in considering conservation projects, the focus should not be placed only on the \$30 million allocation made by the Environment and Conservation Fund in 2017-18. On the front of implementing conservation projects, mutual trust should be built through communication. It was also proposed that a single to two projects be implemented first in a bid to prove their effectiveness.

Agenda Item 6: Traffic and Transport Issues in Tung Chung

(TTDII SC Paper No. 02/2017)

22. Mr SIU Kang-chuen, Chief Traffic Engineer/New Territories East, TD, briefed Members on this document.

23. Some Members considered that construction of a coastal road connecting Tai O to Tung Chung would not only reduce the residents' travelling time to urban areas from 55 minutes to 13 minutes, which was in compliance with the low carbon principle and road standards, but also attract indigenous residents, for instance the residents in the Sha Lo Wan area, to return for homes and career developments in Lantau. However, some other Members considered that such a road would pass

(Translated Version)

through quite a number of private lands, which in turn would induce inharmonious private developments and put the environment in jeopardy.

24. A member proposed that the TD should allow New Territories taxis to alight passengers at the locations with higher pedestrian flows, including the AsiaWorld-Expo.

25. Some Members indicated that the footpath beside Tat Tung Road/Shun Tung Road in Tung Chung was very wide. It was proposed that the TD should re-zone part of the footpath as slow lane carriageways, in a bid to help facilitate bus and coach flow and alleviate road traffic congestion. Moreover, some other Members proposed that the wide green belt beside Tat Tung Road be switched to parking spaces for large vehicles and coaches. They also proposed that the road traffic congestion at Exit A of MTR Tung Chung Station be improved and alleviated.

26. In addition, some Members pointed out that given the narrower width of South Lantau Road as compared to standard roads and the fact that the narrowest section was only 6.4 metres in width, coach drivers had to take extra caution when driving along the road.

27. In responding to Members' views, Mr SIU Kang-chuen, Chief Traffic Engineer/New Territories East, TD, indicated as follows:

- The current operating area for New Territories taxis was formulated under the existing transport policy, under which New Territories taxis were allowed to travel to major infrastructures (for example the airport and the future Hong Kong Boundary Crossing Facilities of HZMB). There were, however, no plans on the part of the Government to extend the operating area for New Territories taxis to the AsiaWorld-Expo;
- The TD would continue discussing with the Members options for improving the traffic conditions in the areas around Tat Tung Road/Shun Tung Road/Hing Tung Street;
- At present, the width of South Lantau Road could broadly cope with the traffic demand for the road. There were no plans to widen the road in an extensive manner at this stage. However, we would continue following up on the feasible improvement measures; and
- The TD would further examine, upon completion of the future Tung Chung town centre works, how to optimise the vacant places for boarding and alighting made available by relocation of the existing temporary bus terminus

(Translated Version)

next to the Tung Chung Station, with a view to meeting the parking and transport demands in the vicinity of the area.

28. Ms LI Chi-miu, Phyllis, Deputy Director of Planning/Territorial, PlanD, pointed out that as there would be no railway running directly to the Boundary Crossing Facilities Island of HZMB, some visitors would change for MTR at Tung Chung Station en route to various districts in Hong Kong. She made an enquiry to the TD if the Hing Tung Street Interchange had the carrying capacity to cope with the additional vehicular flow caused by the commissioning of the HZMB.

29. Ms HO Wai-yin, Irene, Assistant Commissioner/New Territories, TD, indicated that relevant sectors had been earlier consulted on the local transport arrangements for the Hong Kong Boundary Crossing Island of HZMB, including extension of the service network of the airport bus route A to the Hong Kong Boundary Crossing Island, as well as provision of feeder bus and green minibus routes, etc. The Government was reviewing such arrangements and the results would be announced once available.

Agenda Item 7: Any Other Business

30. The Chairperson of SD SC expressed gratitude to the Members for attending the meeting. There being no other business, the meeting was adjourned at 5:15 pm.