

**(Translated Version)**

**Lantau Development Advisory Committee  
Traffic and Transport Subcommittee  
Second Meeting**

Date: 10 November 2014 (Monday)

Time: 3:00 p.m. to 6:10 p.m.

Venue: Conference Room of Transport Department, Room 4110B, 41st Floor, Immigration Tower, 7 Gloucester Road, Wan Chai, Hong Kong

**Gist of Meeting**

**Members Present**

Mr Billy LAM	Chairperson of Traffic and Transport Subcommittee (TT SC)
Ms CHAU Chuen-heung	Deputy Chairperson of TT SC
Hon CHAN Han-pan	
Hon WU Chi-wai	
Mr Randy YU Hon-kwan	
Mr Cheung Tsz-kei	
Mr LEE Chi-fung	
Dr Ernest LEE	
Mr Andy LO Kwong-shing	
Mr WONG Siu-keung	
Mrs Ingrid YEUNG	Commissioner for Transport, Transport Department (TD)
Mr TO Kam-biu, David	Deputy Commissioner/Planning and Technical Services, TD
Mr Rico TSANG	Assistant Secretary for Transport and Housing (Transport)3B, Transport and Housing Bureau (THB)
Mr Kelvin LO	Principal Assistant Secretary(Works)5, Development Bureau (DEVB)

**(Translated Version)**

Miss Janet WONG	Principal Assistant Secretary (Special Duties)Works, DEVB
Mr Bosco CHAN	Deputy Project Manager (Hong Kong and Islands), Civil Engineering and Development Department (CEDD)
Mr Robert CHAN	Chief Engineer/Railway Development 22, Highways Department (HyD)
Ms Bonnie MAN	Assistant District Officer(Islands)2, Home Affairs Department (HAD)
Ms. Amy CHEUNG Yi-mei,	Assistant Director of Planning/Territorial, Planning Department (PlanD)
Mr Jeffrey CHIM	Senior Administrative Officer (Tourism)2, Commerce and Economic Development Bureau (CEDB)
Mr Gary WONG Chi-fai	Chief Executive Officer (Policy and Development), DEVB Secretary of TT SC

**Members Absent with Apologies**

Mr CHAN Yung  
Mr Allen HA Wing-on  
Professor HO Kin-chung  
Dr James WANG Ji-xian  
Mr Ivan CHU Kwok-leung

**In Attendance**

Mr Franklin LAM Fan-keung  
Mr SIU Kang-chuen  
Mr. Chris CHAN Yu-yuen  
Ms Irene HO

Chief Engineer/New Territories East, TD  
Assistant Commissioner/Planning, TD  
Assistant Commissioner/New Territories, TD

**(Translated Version)**

Mr Honson YUEN	Chief Transport Officer/New Territories South West, TD
Mr LI Kam Por	Acting Chief Engineer / Strategic Roads, TD
Mr Isaac LO	Senior Engineer/Islands, TD
Mr Horace HONG Wing	Senior Engineer 8/Hong Kong-Zhuhai-Macao Bridge, HyD
Mr Johnny CHAN Chi-ho	Senior Engineer 13/ Hong Kong-Zhuhai-Macao Bridge, HyD
Mr Joe YIP	Assistant Secretary(Land Supply)1, DEVB
Ms Joyce LI	Engineer(Land Supply)Special Duties, DEVB
Miss Erica WONG	Senior Executive Officer (Lantau), DEVB
Mr Raymond IP	Senior Engineer/Project 4, CEDD
Mr David LO Kwok-chung	Chief Engineer (Islands), CEDD
Mr Wilson MA Hon-wing	Senior Engineer/Project Management (Islands Division), CEDD
Mr Stephen WONG	Senior Planning Coordinator, PlanD

1. The Chairperson welcomed all Members, co-opted members and government representatives to the second meeting of the TT SC, and invited SC members, government representatives, and those in attendance attending the meeting for the first time to briefly introduce themselves.

**Agenda item 1: Confirmation of the Gist of the Last Meeting**

2. The Chairperson said that the Secretariat had distributed draft gist of the last meeting to Members for their perusal prior to this meeting and that the following section was added to the end of Paragraph 14 of the draft as suggested by the AFCD:

"As regards the road management measures referred to in this agenda item, Mr. Joseph SHAM, Assistant Director of the AFCD (Country and Marine Parks) pointed out that recent discussions conducted by the Planning and Conservation Subcommittee (PC SC) of the Lantau Development Advisory Committee (LanDAC) still used natural conservation as the planning intention for South Lantau. The AFCD supported sustainable tourist activities and encouraged visitors to travel to tourist destinations

**(Translated Version)**

(including country parks) via public transport, to support the intention of the natural conservation planning for South Lantau. In addition to boosting visitor flow, tourism development should focus more on maintaining the quality of tourism services and delivering a good recreational experience for tourists.

3. Members raised no objections to the above proposal, and did not make other changes to the draft. The SC endorsed the revised gist of the first meeting.

**Agenda item 2: Matters Arising**

**Current Lantau Public Transport Arrangements and Traffic and Transport Facilities Working Group(Paragraph 13 of the gist of 1st meeting)**

4. The Chairperson suggested that the last meeting confirmed the formation of a working group to study the proposal for current traffic and transport arrangements, thereby stepping up efforts to improve relevant services. Dr WANG Jixian, James agreed to serve as Chairperson of the working group. The Chairperson invited members to join the working group.

**Agenda item 3: Road Projects Related to Hong Kong Zhuhai and Macau Bridge**

(TT SC Paper No. 07/2014)

5. Mr. CHAN Yu-yuen, Assistant Commissioner/Planning, and Mr. K. P. LI, Chief Engineer/Strategic Roads (Acting), of TD, outlined the road construction work associated with the Hong Kong-Zhuhai-Macao Bridge (HZMB) and the proposed development plan for topside development at the Hong Kong Boundary Crossing Facilities (HKBCF).
6. Members made comments in the discussion on this item, which were summarized as follows:
  - 6.1 A study was suggested to be conducted on the capacity of hotels in the vicinity to serve the possible large number of tourists arising from the commissioning of the HZMB.
  - 6.2 With regard to the connecting roads between the HKBCF island and Lantau, departments should consider allowing a sufficient number of connections where appropriate to connect with the area in proximity of Tai Ho Wan and conduct a study on future transport interchange, such as developing facilities like a rail track, to

**(Translated Version)**

enable tourists to have quick access to the airport from the HKBCF island.

- 6.3 Based on the traffic forecast of 14,000 vehicles per day at the initial stage of the Bridge's commissioning., it was estimated that 700,000 square meters of parking area for private cars would be required. Departments were suggested to allow sufficient parking spaces.
  - 6.4 It was suggested that the current consultancy for the topside development at the HKBCF should include study on whether there is need to build a rail transport system to meet the future traffic demand. To cope with the expected bridgehead-driven economy, departments should consider building railway facilities to link up the airport, HKBCF and the Tung Chung Town to facilitate and attract more workers to work on the HKBCF island.
  - 6.5 Due to the current shortage of day-parking spaces at the airport, it was suggested to allow more such parking spaces at the HKBCF.
  - 6.6 It was suggested that the SkyPier should be relocated to the HKBCF island to facilitate the passenger flow and sharing of customs facilities, thereby reducing the negative impact on the environment and freeing up valuable land for other purposes.
  - 6.7 Departments were suggested to consider increasing the number of stations along the existing railway to meet the growing demand for transport services.
7. The SC noted the contents of the paper.

**Agenda item 4: External Ferry Services for Lantau**

(TT SC Paper No. 08/2014)

8. Ms. Irene HO, Assistant Commissioner/New Territories, TD, briefed Members on the current ferry service in Lantau, the main factors that led the authorities to consider setting up a new ferry service, the role of ferries in Hong Kong's transport system, and major considerations of the authorities regarding the proposal to start a new ferry service.
9. Members made comments and discussions on related matters, which were summarised as follows:

**(Translated Version)**

- 9.1 As a large number of tourists would visit Tai O on weekends and Sundays, the Department was advised to discuss with service contractors about offering extra ferry services on Saturdays and Sundays in addition to regular public transport service, such as buses.
  - 9.2 A multi-pronged approach should be adopted to solve Lantau's traffic and transport problems. It was suggested that the Department should consider the need to review road closure measures in South Lantau as discussed at the last SC meeting and the proposal to be discussed later about building new link roads. On opening up the closed roads in South Lantau, the TD explained that this was not due to the limited road capacity, but was mainly based on the Lantau conservation policy.
  - 9.3 Using ferries as the main means of public transport was not cost-effective, as its high operating cost would make ferry fares expensive. The long-term solution was to build more roads.
  - 9.4 The direct ferry service from Mui Wo to Hei Ling Chau had been cancelled, forcing passengers to change ferries at Peng Chau to travel to Hei Ling Chau. The original ferry route be restored for the convenience of local residents.
  - 9.5 The relevant bureaux/departments should contact contractors to provide ferry services to link up with the main attractions in Lantau and areas such as Tung Chung, Ngong Ping, Tai O, Disneyland, Peng Chau, and Mui Wo. At the request of the Chairperson, the Commerce and Economic Development Bureau would provide examples of schedule for Lantau tours organised by local travel agencies, including transportation arrangements after the meeting, for Members' reference.
  - 9.6 Discussions should be made with the Hong Kong Tourism Board to contract out two ferries to provide short-term and fast transport services during holidays to ease the traffic burden. The charter fee was preliminarily estimated at HK\$2 million each year.
  - 9.7 To widen the customer base, the SkyPier should be opened up, so that visitors could make a tour of Hong Kong in addition to taking flights out of Hong Kong.
  - 9.8 In handling contractors' service applications, relevant departments should coordinate efforts to offer more and faster services for the general public.
10. Members had no other comments, and the SC noted the contents of the paper.

**Agenda item 5: Conceptual Layout Plan and Construction Programme on Cycle Track in Lantau**

(TT SC Paper No. 09/2014)

11. Mr. LO Kwok-chung, David, Chief Engineer/Islands, CEDD, briefed members on the proposed bike trail/mountain bike trail network for Lantau. The CEDD would first improve Mui Wo bike trail, the bike trail along North Lantau Coast from Tung Chung to Sunny Bay, and the mountain bike trail in South Lantau in stages, and then explore the feasibility of extending the bike trail/mountain bike trail to other parts of Lantau, including the mountain bike trail from Mui Wo to Tai Ho, the coastal bike trail/mountain bike trail in North Lantau from Tung Chung to Fan Lau, and the coastal bike trail in South Lantau.
  
12. Members made comments and discussions on related items, which were summarised as follows:
  - 12.1 Mr. Bosco CHAN Bun-pui, Deputy Project Manager (HK Island & Islands), CEDD, said that the mountain bike trail was a new project, for which no planning guidelines were currently available. However, some mountain bike trails had been built and used by members of the general public in South Lantau. These tracks were partly located within the area designated for country parks and hiking trails. The CEDD was conducting a study on the connection of existing mountain bike trails, and would follow safety guidelines in the design to ensure the safety of hikers and mountain bike trail users. The Department would build mountain bike trails and training grounds based on overseas standards, and also discuss with the AFCD building and managing mountain bike trails in the country park.
  
  - 12.2 The construction of cycle tracks could be tied in with tourism development. After the meeting, the CEDD would provide data showing the construction order of these bike trails.
  
  - 12.3 If the bike trail along the North Lantau coast from Tung Chung to Sunny Bay did not involve reclamation, the project should be completed as soon as possible, not as late as 2020. It was expected that the cycle track would be completed as soon as possible to attract cyclists towards the trail instead of using roads.

**(Translated Version)**

- 12.4 Mr. Bosco CHAN Bun-pui, Deputy Project Manager (HK Island & Islands), CEDD, said that they would review the work progress again. The Department had also received a request to add a 2 metre-wide bike lane to the roadside for faster bikes, but the proposal was restricted by a number of technical issues such as traffic lights and bus stops, and the CEDD would join the TD in exploring other feasible options.
- 12.5 Bike trails were more popular and needed than mountain bike trails. Therefore, priority should be given to studying and expediting the construction of bike trails.
- 12.6 The mountain bike trail from Mui Wo to Tai Ho should not occupy the Olympic Trail; and in the parts of Pak Ngan Heung and Tai Tei Tong, the track should not take up the space for emergency vehicular access.
- 12.7 The Chairperson asked CEDD to provide the construction cost of bike trail for the SC's reference after the meeting.
13. Members had no other comments, and the SC noted the contents of the paper.

**Agenda item 6: Construction of an East West Coastal Road in North Lantau**

(TT SC Paper No. 10/2014)

14. Mr. K. C. SIU, Chief Engineer for Transport/Transport Engineering (New Territories East), TD, provided some rough reference data on the proposal the Committee had received from the general public to build a coastal highway connecting Tung Chung to Tai O via San Tau, Sha Lo Wan, San Shek Wan, Sham Shek Tsuen, and Sham Wat. The data included the estimated cost, existing population along the road, and possible travel time saved, as well as the impact of the project on environment, country park, and relics.
15. Members made comments and discussions on related matters, which were summarised as follows:
- 15.1 A Member said that Tai O used to have a population of over 30,000, but due to the lack of roads, the population was currently reduced to only some 2,000. He supported the proposal to build a link road from Tung Chung to Tai O, which would solve the traffic problem in Tai O and also facilitate the daily life of residents. In addition, with more roads in Lantau, restricted areas could be reduced, and ferries should be used to alleviate the traffic burden over the short term.



**(Translated Version)**

- 15.2 The number one benefit of the proposed new road was to shorten travel time significantly. The new road was absolutely worthwhile in terms of creating economic value out of needs from tourism and promoting Lantau as a tourist destination.
- 15.3 Relevant departments might also consider only permitting the use of green transport in Lantau to reduce air pollution caused by vehicles using the new road.
- 15.4 In economic terms, building a new road was more cost effective than building than a bike trail, and so priority should be given to constructing a new road.
- 15.5 As preliminary design concepts were already available for the construction of the new road, road construction should be less technically complex than building a cycle track, and the construction cost was initially projected at HK\$6.3 billion, which was cost-effective.
- 15.6 At present, Tai O was home to merely some 2,000 people, which did not make a mature community, and traffic inconvenience would cause more residents to leave. Supposing there were 30,000 residents, and by rough estimate, around 7 million sq ft of gross floor area, which was worth HK\$14 billion in value, was needed. Therefore, it was completely cost-effective to build a road worth around HK\$6 billion.
- 15.7 With the new road, residents with properties in Tai O but living elsewhere due to traffic inconvenience would return to Tai O, and the construction of the new road would open a new window of opportunity, attracting people to move to the beautiful Lantau. The proposed new road would benefit not only some 2,000 local residents, but also create other opportunities for sectors such as tourism and housing.
- 15.8 A Member said that road construction would take a long time, but only Fortune Ferry to travel to villages including Sha Lo Wan Tsuen, Sham Wat and San Shek Wan Village. Traffic was rather inconvenient. A flyover should be constructed to connect the airport island and nearby Sha Lo Wan.
16. Members had no other comments, and the SC noted the contents of the paper.
17. There being no other business, the meeting was adjourned at 6:10 p.m.