

(Translated Version)

**Lantau Development Advisory Committee
Traffic and Transport Subcommittee
First Meeting**

Date : 30 October 2014 (Thursday)
Time : 3:00 p.m. to 6:15 p.m.
Venue : Conference Room of Transport Department, Room 4110B, 41st Floor, Immigration Tower, 7 Gloucester Road, Wan Chai, Hong Kong

Gist of Meeting

Members Present

Mr Billy LAM	Chairperson of Traffic and Transport Subcommittee (TT SC)
Ms CHAU Chuen-heung	Deputy Chairperson of TT SC
Mr CHAN Yung	
Mr Allen HA Wing-on	
Professor HO Kin-chung	
Dr James WANG Ji-xian	
Mr Cheung Tsz-kei	
Mr LEE Chi-fung	
Dr Ernest LEE	
Mr Andy LO Kwong-shing	
Mrs Ingrid YEUNG	Commissioner for Transport, Transport Department (TD)
Mr TO Kam-biu, David	Deputy Commissioner/Planning and Technical Services, TD
Ms Judy CHUNG Sui-kei	Principal Assistant Secretary for Transport and Housing (Transport)5, Transport and Housing Bureau
Mr CHAN Chi-ming	Deputy Secretary(Works)2, Development Bureau (DEVB)

(Translated Version)

Mr Kelvin LO	Principal Assistant Secretary(Works)5, DEVB
Mr Bosco CHAN	Deputy Project Manager (Hong Kong and Islands), Civil Engineering and Development Department (CEDD)
Mr Robert CHAN	Chief Engineer/Railway Development 22, Highways Department (HyD)
Ms Josephine TSANG	Acting District Officer (Islands), Home Affairs Department (HAD)
Ms Winnie LAU	Chief Town Planner/Strategic Planning, Planning Department (PlanD)
Mr Jeffrey CHIM	Senior Administrative Officer (Tourism)2, Commerce and Economic Development Bureau (CEDB)
Mr Gary WONG Chi-fai	Chief Executive Officer (Policy and Development), DEVB Secretary of TT SC

Members Absent with Apologies

Hon CHAN Han-pan

Hon WU Chi-wai

Mr Randy YU Hon-kwan

Mr Ivan CHU Kwok-leung

Mr WONG Siu-keung

In Attendance

Mr Franklin LAM Fan-keung

Mr SIU Kang-chuen

Acting Assistant Commissioner/New Territories, TD

Mr Edmond POON

Acting Assistant Commissioner/New Territories, TD

Mr Honson YUEN

Chief Transport Officer/New Territories South West,
TD

Mr Peter MAK

Chief Engineer / Strategic Roads, TD

(Translated Version)

Mr Isaac LO	Senior Engineer/ Islands, TD
Mr. Chris CHAN Yu-yuen	Assistant Commissioner/Planning, TD
Mr WONG Kwok-fai	Senior Engineer/Technical Services, HyD
Mr Joseph SHAM	Assistant Director (Country Parks and Marine Parks), AFCD
Ms YN NGAR	Senior Country Parks Officer (North West), AFCD
Ms Bonnie MAN	Assistant District Officer (Islands)2, HAD
Mr Joe YIP	Assistant Secretary (Land Supply)1, DEVB
Ms Joyce LI	Engineer (Land Supply) Special Duties, DEVB
Miss Erica WONG	Senior Executive Officer (Lantau), DEVB
Mr Raymond IP	Senior Engineer/Project 4, CEDD
Mr David LO Kwok-chung	Chief Engineer (Islands), CEDD
Mr Wilson MA Hon-wing	Senior Engineer/Project Management (Islands Division), CEDD
Mr Stephen WONG	Senior Planning Coordinator, PlanD

1. The Chairperson welcomed all Members, co-opted members and government representatives to the first meeting of the TT SC, and invited Members, government representatives, and those in attendance to briefly introduce themselves.

Agenda item 1: Terms of Reference, House Rules and System of Declaration of Interests

(TT SC Paper No. 01/2014)

2. The Chairperson outlined the main points of the paper, including the proposed terms of reference, and the adoption of the house rules and the system of declaration of interests of the Lantau Development Advisory Committee (LanDAC)'s to ensure consistency with the LanDAC's rules. For the sake of clarity, the Chairperson proposed deleting the term "(if any)" from the section regarding the terms of reference.

3. The Chairperson informed the SC that Dr. Ernest S W LEE had agreed to be a co-opted member.

4. No specific comment was raised at the meeting. The revised terms of reference, the house

(Translated Version)

rules and the system of declaration of interests proposed at the meeting were endorsed.

Agenda item 2: Work Plan of the Traffic and Transport Subcommittee

(TT SC Paper No. 02/2014)

5. Mrs. Ingrid YEUNG, Commissioner for Transport, briefed Members about the proposed work plans, including the items initially proposed for discussion at the coming three meetings.

6. Comments and discussions on the work plans made by Members were summarised as follows:

- (i) The proposed extension of Ngong Ping 360 to Tai O, which was tourism related, would be included as one of the agenda items of the second meeting of the Economic and Social Development Subcommittee (ESD SC) for discussion .
- (ii) Future meetings should include taxis and green transportation system of Lantau.
- (iii) In discussing the development proposal for Lantau, the TT SC should discuss how to align traffic and transport arrangements with the infrastructure construction based on the development direction and specific development proposals recommended by the Planning and Conservation Subcommittee (PC SC) and the ESD SC. The TT SC would inform the aforesaid two SCs about the traffic and transport arrangements and the infrastructure construction proposed by the TT SC, so that the three SCs would be able to adjust and consolidate the development proposals for Lantau as appropriate.
- (iv) The proposals should be based on a long-term prospective to ensure that projects match with Lantau and Hong Kong's long-term development objectives.
- (v) When making proposals, departments should keep the proposals in line with Lantau's development vision and provide justifications for such proposals for reference.
- (vi) In reviewing traffic and transport proposals, departments should focus on the proposals, list and prioritize the short, medium and long-term proposals so as to formulate a comprehensive blueprint for traffic and transport attuned to the development of Lantau.

(Translated Version)

7. The SC noted the preliminary contents of the work plans set out in the paper.

Agenda item 3: An Overview of the Current Road Network in Lantau and the Major Road Improvement Projects Completed in Recent Years

(TT SC Paper No. 03/2014)

8. Mr. K. C. SIU, Assistant Commissioner for Transport/New Territories (Acting) briefed the meeting on Lantau's existing road network, major road projects completed over recent years, and future development of the road network in Lantau. Related projects included improvements to Tung Chung Road, Ngong Ping Road, Ngong Ping Bus Terminus, Tai O Bus Terminus, Keung Shan Road, and South Lantau Road, as well as Tung Chung New Town Extension and improvement works at Tai O and Mui Wo, among others. Mr. K. C. SIU said that as many as eight road improvement projects along Keung Shan Road and South Lantau Road had been completed, and another new improvement project was under way, but he pointed out that the projects undertaken by the HyD were sometimes delayed due to factors such as underground facilities, slopes, trees and access to the country park area.

9. Comments and discussions on the existing road network and major road projects completed in Lantau in recent years were summarised as follows:

- (i) The improvement works of Tai O Promenade and entrance to the plaza should be completed as soon as possible. Due to the lack of parking space for coaches, traffic management measures such as forbidding coaches from parking after passengers alight, and leveling down the vacant lot next to the football pitch to provide more parking spaces, should be implemented.
- (ii) Although improvement works had been carried out at Keung Shan Road, the government should widen Keung Shan Road as soon as possible to maintain road safety as the coaches and buses now using the road were becoming longer.
- (iii) Instead of making small repairs only, long term traffic and transport improvement measures should be taken to serve the development needs of Lantau. In addition, traffic and transport improvements were generally applied only to roadways but the impact of narrowed footpaths on tourists had been ignored. Improvement projects for the footpaths should be considered at the same time.
- (iv) To achieve a green tourist economy, pedestrian and cycling tracks were essential. One of the challenges in straightening Keung Shan Road was to tackle steep slopes.

(Translated Version)

Moreover, the environmental requirements should be observed if reclamation was needed to open up roads. Therefore, advance and forward-looking designs and plans would be necessary.

- (v) Community consensus was needed in the proposed opening up the link road from Tung Chung to Tai O. Studies should be conducted on the capacity of Tai O to ensure its sustainable development, so that the flow of traffic could be estimated.
- (vi) An interchange station should be set up at an appropriate location to provide eco-friendly shuttle buses for tourists to travel to and from Tai O so as to facilitate better traffic control. This could be a short-term pilot programme and considered together with medium to long-term major road works such as building tunnels and overhead bridges.
- (vii) However, there was also the view that provision of eco-friendly shuttle buses might not be feasible as visitors to Tai O also included local residents.
- (viii) Currently, Keung Shan Road had yet to address the traffic safety issue, and the improvement plan should be implemented as soon as possible.
- (ix) Both sides of Keung Shan Road were now grown with *Acacia confusa* trees, which were considered by the environmental groups being not suitable for roads in Hong Kong. When widening Keung Shan Road, consideration should be given to removing the *Acacia confusa* trees if necessary for more space. Moreover, residents in Lantau had not asked for widening the whole Keung Shan Road to 7.3 metres, but it was imperative that South Lantau Road be improved and Keung Shan Road be widened. Departments should provide the time schedule and data for the road improvement project.
- (x) Departments should provide for reference detailed Saturday and Sunday traffic flow data on two sections of Keung Shan Road, one between Sham Wat Road and Tai O Bus Terminus and one between Sham Wat Road and Mui Wo.
- (xi) Mr. K. C. SIU, Assistant Commissioner for Transport/New Territories (Acting), explained these issues as follows: Currently, while only average daily traffic flow data based on an average of flow data measured over a year was available for Keung Shan Road, but based on daily observations, no congestion was found on these sections either during holidays or in other days, and the Department had not received any reports or complaints about traffic congestion. As regards traffic safety on the road, Mr.

(Translated Version)

K. C. SIU reported six traffic accidents in year 2013, five of which involved only a single bicycle, with only one case involving motor vehicles.

- (xii) The AFCD representative said that they would be pleased to support the road improvement projects.

10. The SC noted the contents of the paper.

Agent item 4: Proposals Related to Existing Traffic and Transport Arrangements and Facilities in Lantau Submitted by Members of the LanDAC and the Public

(TT SC Paper No. 04/2014)

11. With regard to the proposals on existing public transport service agreements and transport facilities, Mr. POON Chi Man, Assistant Commissioner for Transport/New Territories (Acting), briefed the SC on the opinions and proposals in relation to traffic and transport set out in Annex 1, and the follow-up actions mentioned in Annex 2.

12. Members' comments and discussions on the proposals submitted by the LanDAC and members of the public regarding current Lantau public transport arrangements and traffic and transport facilities were summarised as follows:

- (i) Members supported the split of the S64 bus route to help residents reach their destinations more quickly. However, as bus service was also in great demand for AsiaWorld Expo, the bus route should be further extended to locations such as AsiaWorld Expo and nearby hotels. Similarly, Members also expected similar arrangements for S56 to serve more residents.
- (ii) The proposal of splitting the bus route was similar to the route when it was initially put into service, i.e., passing through the cargo area, en-route area, airport terminal, and the Chek Lap Kok Ferry Pier (now the locations such as Marriott Hotel and AsiaWorld Expo). Due to a substantial reduction in passenger flow for S64 a few years ago, the bus route was changed to the current status. To keep up with the growing number of passengers, the bus route should be restored to its original plan.
- (iii) Although the TD had explained that whether green minibus service in Lantau could be commissioned depended very much on the demand, operational needs and financial viability of the service, we could first introduce minibus or other transport operators for North Lantau through bidding to test the response from the industry.

(Translated Version)

However, there was also a contrasting view that we should not invite bidding of minibus service without taking into account other factors, in particular the impact of the introduction of minibuses on the franchised bus service.

- (iv) In assessing the operational and financial feasibility of the green minibus service, the difficulty of hiring minibus drivers nowadays should also be considered.
- (v) In many places in Lantau, such as two direct subsidy scheme schools in the north of Tung Chung and some old villages, no all-day public transport service was available at the moment. In addition, the occupation of the housing estate in Tung Chung North next year would also increase the demand for public transport services, and so only a single bus company is insufficient to serve Lantau. As there were many tourist attractions in Lantau, provision of adequate public transport connections would attract more visitors. Therefore, there would be no undersupply and operation problems by keeping the bus company financially healthy.
- (vi) Provision of interchange arrangements for Route A and Route E at the Lantau Link Toll Plaza is welcome, but a bigger bus fare discount was expected for the interchange to attract more passengers.
- (vii) The survey on staff commuting needs to be conducted shortly by the Airport Authority should also cover major organisations in Lantau, such as AsiaWorld Expo, hotels, freight companies, HAECO, Cathay Pacific, and Citygate. Respondents might include residents working in the area, air passengers, as well as visitors to Lantau wishing to watch shows, so as to gather more data.
- (viii) To encourage people to work in Lantau, public transport should be made more convenient, such as operating some direct bus routes. Although the fare might be more expensive than that for roundabout routes, the shortened journey time would attract people to work in Lantau.
- (ix) Apart from existing transport services, such as the railway, franchised buses, and employees' service, customized bus service, which allows people to book bus seats on the Internet to commute between their homes and workplaces, should be introduced. Although the fare was relatively higher, the customized bus service would save ride time considerably and remove the need for bus changes, making it more convenient and attractive for users of the service.

13. The Chairperson suggested that the SC set up a working group, so that Members and the

(Translated Version)

TD could discuss with bus companies and study public transport arrangements, thereby stepping up efforts to improve and optimize services. Dr. WANG Jixian, James agreed to serve as Chairperson of the working group.

Agenda item 5: Traffic and Transport Arrangements and Measures Put in Place to Reflect the Current Planning Intention for Lantau : South Lantau Closed Roads

(TT SC Paper No. 05/2014)

14. Mr. POON Chi Man, Assistant Commissioner for Transport/New Territories(Acting) briefed Members on existing road closure arrangements in South Lantau.

15. As regards the road management measures referred to in this item, Mr. Joseph SHAM, Assistant Director of the AFCD (Country and Marine Parks) pointed out that recent discussions conducted by the PC SC of the LanDAC still used natural conservation as the planning intention for South Lantau. The AFCD supported sustainable tourist activities and encouraged visitors to travel to tourist destinations (including country parks) via public transport, to support the intention of the natural conservation planning for South Lantau. In addition to boosting passenger traffic, tourism development should focus more on maintaining the quality of tourism services and delivering a good recreational experience for tourists.

16. At the meeting, Members brought up the following major issues:

- (i) If departments still intended to maintain the planning intention of using South Lantau as a conservation area and retain the policy of road closure in South Lantau as part of the traffic control measure, this would conflict with the concepts of developing green tourism in Lantau and boosting local economic development. Departments should consider developing Lantau from a forward-looking perspective, and might launch a pilot scheme to review the situation in a bid to support the long-term development of Lantau.
- (ii) Although most visitors could take the existing franchised buses (Take Lantau Bus 11 for example. The bus carried 11,000 passengers between Tung Chung and Tai O over the full course of one Sunday, and about half of these passengers or 5,000 people were tourists), and each day, about 30 buses with temporary permits for South Lantau Road carried tour groups (about 1,500 passengers), roads in Lantau still had spare capacity for more buses under the current closed road permit system.
- (iii) Opening up the South Lantau Road involved long-term positioning. To develop

(Translated Version)

tourism in Lantau, appropriate supporting transport facilities should be provided. Therefore, better coordination with the other two SCs should be in place in handling the relevant issues.

- (iv) The existing daily quota of 30 buses had yet to be used up, as the average round-trip fare in Lantau was higher than that in other areas. Meanwhile, due to inconvenient transport, currently tourists often had to wait a long time on their return trip when taking public transport, which might hinder the development of Lantau.
- (v) Road closure measure in South Lantau was designed to support the South Lantau conservation policy, rather than a result of inadequate road capacity. The SC was advised to draw upon suggestions from the other two SCs in reviewing the road closure issue in South Lantau.

17. The SC should review the existing arrangements in due course after referring to the discussions of the other two SCs on South Lantau.

Agenda item 6: Introduction to the East Lantau Metropolis Plan and Road Links between East Lantau Metropolis and Lantau

(TT SC Paper No. 06/2014)

18. Mr. YIP Wai-man, Senior Engineer of CEDD, briefed Members on East Lantau Metropolis and the concept plan of strategic transport infrastructure for Lantau.

19. At the meeting, Members brought up the following major issues:

- (i) The development of East Lantau Metropolis was a long-term programme, while the central waters should also be positioned as a point of interconnection in Lantau. The Government should first study whether to connect with Mui Wo as soon as possible and explore the feasibility of building a North-South channel to connect with Siu Ho.
- (ii) If only about 1,000 hectares of island is reclaimed on central waters, the land would be insufficient for future development of Hong Kong and Lantau. Apart from reclamation, consideration should be given to developing Chi Ma Wan, so that we would be able to reduce the reclamation cost by using mountain clay as fill soil, and larger areas of land would become available for development.

20. Members had no other comments, and the SC noted the contents of the paper.

(Translated Version)

21. There being no other business, the meeting was adjourned at 6:15 p.m.